



IGCP Scientific Board
Scientific Review of IGCP Project Annual Reports
Annual Assessment Form

SHORT TITLE OF PROJECT: Identity, Facies, and Time – The Ediacaran/Vendian Problem

Principle Investigator(s) (and their Countries)	Patricia Vickers-Rich (Australia), Mikhail A. Fedonkin (Russia), Jim Gehling (Australia), and Guy Narbonne (Canada)
Duration of Project	2010-2014
History of IGCP Funding	\$USD 10,000
History of External Funds	\$USD
Future funding Requests	\$USD 10,000
Current Funding Status	\$USD 7,500
Project Theme Category (select only one category)	<input type="checkbox"/> Earth Resources Geoscience and Water <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Global Change and the Evolution of Life <input type="checkbox"/> Geohazards <input type="checkbox"/> Geoscience and Water <input type="checkbox"/> Deep Earth <input type="checkbox"/> Other topic
EVALUATION SCORE LEGEND TO BE USED AS APPROPRIATE BELOW:	<p align="center"> 1 = Poor - Strongly Disagree 2 = Low - Disagree 3 = Average - Neutral 4 = High - Agree 5 = Excellent - Strongly Agree </p>
Scientific Achievements: Is the project generating new and/or exciting scientific achievements, results, scientific ideas, and/or data?	<p>Comments: This project focuses on the Ediacaran (Vendian) age which is the first animal time, therefore the project subject is one of the most fascinated geologic topics gathering general interest. Yes, this is a very active project, which has established an extensive network of collaborators across the globe. In particular, the outreach activities are quite impressive. High-quality work continues to be produced, including detailed work particularly in Canada, Australia and Namibia. Field work in Saudi Arabia opens an exciting new window for research in Ediacaran geology and paleobiology.</p>
Evaluation Score:	<input type="checkbox"/> 1 <input type="checkbox"/> 2 <input type="checkbox"/> 3 <input type="checkbox"/> 4 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 5

<p>Scientific Quality: Is the quality of the work consistent with the scientific objectives of IGCP, UNESCO and IUGS, and does it provide a basis for future research?</p>	<p>Comments: Yes, there is a nice balance between exploration of “frontier” areas (Saudi Arabia, Brazil) and detailed, more in-depth work in more classic sections (e.g. Canada). Both are conducive for further research, fulfilling the general objectives of IGCP, UNESCO and IUGS of international cooperation in scientific production. This project expands our understanding of a crucial time in Earth history and it is basis for future exciting research. There are many high quality and high-impact academic papers published concerning to this project aims, such as Chemical Geology, Geology, and cover article of Journal of Paleontology. A lot of high quality work on social benefits in wide-ranged (exhibitions, books, etc) was produced.</p>
<p>Evaluation Score:</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> 1 <input type="checkbox"/> 2 <input type="checkbox"/> 3 <input type="checkbox"/> 4 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 5</p>
<p>Project Participation: Does the number, the geographic and scientific discipline distribution of the participants meet IGCP standards? (e.g. participation of developing countries)</p>	<p>Comments: There is no precise list and data of participants for two meetings held in 2013 which were Corumba (Brazil) and Arabian Shield meetings. More than 42 and 14 participants attended from the host and other countries including developing countries for these meetings and a note about the project-activities continued on Namibia, Iran, India, Saudi Arabia and Brazil, but it is not clear percentage of each. The spectrum of countries involved is wide, including participants from developing countries (e.g. Timor-Leste) and BRIC (e.g. Brazil) countries. One of the leaders of the project is a female scientist. Full participation of female scientists cannot be evaluated because they are not listed separately and in the financial statement all names correspond to male students. However, in the report it is stated that many women were able to attend the Corumba meeting in Brazil due to funding provided by IGCP 587.</p>
<p>Evaluation Score:</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> 1 <input type="checkbox"/> 2 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 3 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 4 <input type="checkbox"/> 5</p>
<p>Project Meetings: Did the project organize/contribute to meetings, conferences, workshops, short courses and other capacity building?</p>	<p>Comments: Two field conferences took place in 2013 (Brazil & Saudi Arabia). These meeting were very important to establish numerous institutional and professional relationships, including mentoring young scientists. Field conferences were organized with the modality of workshops. No short courses were offered in 2013.</p>
<p>Evaluation Score:</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> 1 <input type="checkbox"/> 2 <input type="checkbox"/> 3 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 4 <input type="checkbox"/> 5</p>
<p>Project Collaboration: Extent, evidence and appropriateness of project collaboration with other IGCP projects.</p>	<p>Comments: There is no description of collaboration with other IGCP projects. A long list of institutional collaborations were noted in the report. Many of these institutions provided help in kind during field trips and visits.</p>
<p>Evaluation Score:</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> 1 <input type="checkbox"/> 2 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 3 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 4 <input type="checkbox"/> 5</p>
<p>Project Work Plan: The work plan and schedule for the next year is appropriate and feasible.</p>	<p>Comments: Yes, it is appropriate and plausible. Two major activities are outlined in the report. One field conference in Argentina and a Symposium and field workshop of the Ediacaran Subdivision to be held in Yangtze Gorges, China.</p>
<p>Evaluation Score:</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> 1 <input type="checkbox"/> 2 <input type="checkbox"/> 3 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 4 <input type="checkbox"/> 5</p>

<p>Project Communication: Scientific publications (e.g. peer-reviewed journals), informal publications (e.g. abstracts, guidebooks, textbooks) and other media (e.g. website, internet access to database, TV programs, exhibits, public briefings for decision makers).</p>	<p>Comments: Scientific publications in peer-reviewed journals (including Journal of paleo special issue with impressive cover) regularly appeared as the result of this project. A very strong component of this project, REALLY outstanding, is the outreach activities. Two exhibits: "Wildlife of Gondwana Exhibition" and "O Mundo Perdido Timor-Leste", the latter have resulted in the publication of a popular science book that one of the project leaders co-authored with the President (and Nobel Prize laureate) of Timor-Leste. This book was translated to 19 languages. Results and activities from this project have been showcased in "First Life", the final episodes in Attenborough's Life Series, helping to disseminate Ediacaran paleobiology among the wider public in a very successful way. This project conducts quite good and high activity on academic/public communications.</p>
<p>Evaluation Score:</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> 1 <input type="checkbox"/> 2 <input type="checkbox"/> 3 <input type="checkbox"/> 4 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 5</p>
<p>Project Website: Content, quality, updated regularly, IGCP/UNESCO/IUGS are recognized, etc.</p>	<p>Comments: The website is updated and displays relevant information regarding the project, including past and future field trips and a list of publications. Pdfs of some papers are included, which helps to distribute information and to make the results of the project widely available. IGCP, UNESCO and IUGS are recognized.</p>
<p>Evaluation Score:</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> 1 <input type="checkbox"/> 2 <input type="checkbox"/> 3 <input type="checkbox"/> 4 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 5</p>
<p>IGCP Funding: The requested funding for next year is appropriate and adequately justified.</p>	<p>Comments: Yes, the requested funding is reasonable, and it is planned to be use IGCP funding to support participation of young scientists to meetings and other activities.</p>
<p>Evaluation Score:</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> 1 <input type="checkbox"/> 2 <input type="checkbox"/> 3 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 4 <input type="checkbox"/> 5</p>
<p>External Funds: The extent of external funding is appropriate and sufficient?</p>	<p>Comments: The project leaders have been really successful in securing funds from other sources such as from National Geographic Society, Art Scientific Museum in Singapore, Explorers Club, Australia grant, private funds, and also Saudi Geological Survey, Institutes of Argentina, Russia, Japan and so on.</p>
<p>Evaluation Score:</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> 1 <input type="checkbox"/> 2 <input type="checkbox"/> 3 <input type="checkbox"/> 4 <input type="checkbox"/> 5</p>
<p>Project Response: The project leaders adequately took into account previous recommendations of the Scientific Board?</p>	<p>Comments: Yes. Considering comments from Scientific Board in the last year, there is information on source and amount of external funds for this project. The request has been adequately followed.</p>
<p>Evaluation Score:</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> 1 <input type="checkbox"/> 2 <input type="checkbox"/> 3 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 4 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 5</p>

RECOMMENDATIONS ON THE BASIS OF THE ABOVE ASSESSMENT:

Overall Score: 1 2 3 4 5

Project should (select only one):

- Continue as planned
- Continue with conditions (see below)
- Continue for one additional year only
- Continue on O.E.T. status (no funding)
- Be closed

Comments/Conditions: This is a very strong project with a nice balance between publication in peer-reviewed journals and outreach activities. It has a wide geographic range and has been very successful in expanding the frontiers of Ediacaran geology in multifaceted ways. Dissemination of the results of the project among the wider public has been outstanding. Recommendations are: 1- To further promote participation of women, particularly young women scientists; 2- To implement short courses or other way of systematic research training for young scientists in developing countries or “less-developed” countries (promoting the development of the different disciplines of expertise of leaders or other well-established participants); 3-More information about participants/attendances to meetings/field conferences is required to see gender and country valances, and also for good evidences for education/training program on young researchers conducted by this project. The leaders are reminded that all IGCP projects are required to publish short paper in *Episodes* summarizing the main scientific accomplishments of their project, and this is normally done in the last year of the project.

Project Review Theme Group: IGCP Global Change and Evolution of Life

Date: February 2014